Applying the Constructs from the Sense of Belongingness to Improve Job Satisfaction and Employee Retention

Sandra Sexton Welling PhD, RN, CCM
Sense of Belonging
Sandra Sexton Welling PhD, RN, CCM
Davenport University

Objectives

- The participant will gain an understanding of the sense of belonging in entry level nurses using social identity theory to investigate the relationship between identity and belonging.
- The participant will gain an understanding of the relationship between the Sense of Belonging and Employee Satisfaction
- The participant will gain an understanding of the relationship between the Sense of Belonging and Employee Retention

No conflicts of interest

Support

- New Mexico State University Dissertation Committee
  - Dr. Anita Reinhardt, Dr. Teresa Keller, Dr. John Scarbrough, and Dr. Donna Wagner
Sense of Belonging

Nursing Turnover

- 30% to 60% of entry level nurses leave the profession within the first year of practice and 57% in the second year (Bowles & Candela, 2005; Halfer & Graf, 2006; Penprase, 2012).

- Turnover results in $30,000 per nurse/per month (Lee, Tzeng, Lin, & Yeh, 2009).

- Entry level nurses commonly struggle with a sense of belonging resulting in:
  - Marginal performance
  - Decreased job dissatisfaction
  - Costly employee turnover (Winter-Collins & McDaniel, 2000).
Theoretical Framework

Tajfel’s (1974) Social Identity Theory
Belongingness forms relationships with a group.
- In-group forms a sense of belonging
  - Us or We
  - Satisfaction
- Out-group attitudes link to conflict of interest.
  - Them
  -Disconnected and negativity

There are three primary elements to Social Identity Theory.
- Self-identity
- Social-categorization
- Group-categorization
Social Identity Theory Model
Methodology

Primary Study – “Why Nursing Stay”

- 258 Registered Nurse respondents in a southwestern state.
- Overall return rate was 36.8%.

Secondary Analysis

- All 258 participants who returned surveys were included in the study. The participants were separated into in-group and out-group.
- In-group - registered nurses who stayed in their first place of employment for over two years.
  - 134 participants
- Out-group - registered nurses who left their first place of employment within the first two years of practice.
  - 107 participants
Methodology

Instruments

- Levett-Jones and Lathlean’s (2009) 34 item Belongingness Scale Clinical Placement Experience (BS-CPE)
- Duddle and Boughton’s (2009) 22 item Nurse Workplace Relational Environment Scale (NWRES)
- Demographic questionnaire
Methodology

Statistical Analysis – out-group and in-group categories
  ▶ Descriptive – to identify in-group and out-group members
  ▶ ANOVA of items
  ▶ Pearson’s correlation of tool scores
  ▶ Linear Regression of scores

Independent Variables
  ▶ Workplace environment
  ▶ Work conflict
  ▶ Job satisfaction
  ▶ In-group and Out-group

Dependent Variables
  ▶ Sense of belonging
In-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of the practice

Reason for in-group leaving in the first job
- Location/transferred (26.9%; n = 36)
- Problem with manager (23.9%; n = 32)
- Challenged to develop new skills (8.2%; n = 11)

Reason for in-group staying in the first job
- Pay/benefits (26.9%; n = 36)
- Comfort with the job (23.1%; n = 31)
- Satisfaction with the employer (22.4%; n = 30)
- Confidence/hours (7.5%; n = 10)
- Feeling of importance (6.7%; n = 9)
- Career advancement (4.5%; n = 6)
Out-group sense of belonging and employee turnover in the first two years of the practice

Reasons for out-group staying in job for first two years.
- Pay/benefits (19.6%; n = 21)
- Satisfaction with employer (17.8%; n = 19)
- Convenience (14%; n = 15)
- Comfortable with the job (10.3%; n = 11)
- Career advancement opportunities (6.5%; n = 7)
- Feeling of importance (2.8%; n = 3)

Reasons out-group left the first nursing job within the first two years of practice.
- Moved to another location/transferred (27.1%; n = 29)
- Problem with manager (22.4%; n = 24)
- Challenged to develop new skills (14%; n = 15)
- Pay/benefits (7.5%; n = 8)
- Lateral violence (7.5%; n = 8)
In-group and out-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of nursing

Pearson’s Correlation from the total scores using the BES-CPE AND NWRES.

- There is a positive correlation between the two variables.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NWRES</th>
<th>BES-CPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NWRES</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BES-CPE</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.496**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In-group and out-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of nursing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In-group</th>
<th>Work Environment</th>
<th>Work Conflict</th>
<th>Job Satisfaction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belonging - Esteem Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.310*</td>
<td>-.193</td>
<td>.372**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.016</td>
<td>.129</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belonging - Efficacy Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.277*</td>
<td>-.111</td>
<td>.180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.029</td>
<td>.380</td>
<td>.162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belonging - Connectedness Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.152</td>
<td>-.115</td>
<td>.346**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.256</td>
<td>.378</td>
<td>.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Out-group</th>
<th>Work Environment</th>
<th>Work Conflict</th>
<th>Job Satisfaction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belonging - Esteem Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.568**</td>
<td>-.222**</td>
<td>.467**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.007</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belonging - Efficacy Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.284**</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>.187*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.613</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belonging - Connectedness Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.447**</td>
<td>-.197*</td>
<td>.245**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.016</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).
** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
In-group and out-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of nursing

Linear Regression for the BES –CPE total score and subscales of the NWRES.

Variables

- Dependent = Belonging total from subscales from the BES-CPE.
- Independent = NWRES subscales (job satisfaction, work environment, and work conflict)

Statistically significant

- Out-group - belongingness and job satisfaction
- In-group - belongingness and work environment
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out-group 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>92.926</td>
<td>14.063</td>
<td>6.608</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Conflict</td>
<td>-.005</td>
<td>.470</td>
<td>-.001</td>
<td>-.011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace Environment</td>
<td>.137</td>
<td>.187</td>
<td>.114</td>
<td>.731</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>1.710</td>
<td>.572</td>
<td>.436</td>
<td>2.991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-group 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>82.279</td>
<td>8.969</td>
<td>9.174</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Conflict</td>
<td>.187</td>
<td>.310</td>
<td>.050</td>
<td>.603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace Environment</td>
<td>.540</td>
<td>.104</td>
<td>.457</td>
<td>5.203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction</td>
<td>.730</td>
<td>.368</td>
<td>.170</td>
<td>1.986</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: belonging total
In-group and out-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of nursing

In-group members stayed in job for:
- Pay/benefits, comfort with the job, and satisfaction with the employer.
- Job satisfaction = quality of workplace relationships = sense of belonging

In-group members left because of:
- Job dissatisfaction and/or they moved to another location.
- They moved because of job advancement, family reasons, and education opportunities.

Additional findings
Social identity strongly influenced self-concept and group categorization through the sense of belonging which is grounded in workplace environment.

Established working environments that help the entry level nurse gain a sense of belonging may increase their job satisfaction.
In-group and out-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of nursing

Out-group members stayed in their first job for two years of less because of:

- Pay/benefits, satisfaction with the employer, and convenience/hours.

Out-group members left their first jobs in less than two years because of:

- Job dissatisfaction (unit conflict), moves/transfers, and/or family-related motives.
In-group and out-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of nursing

Further findings suggest the out-group members left their first job:

- Members left because they did not have a sense of belonging related to job satisfaction.
- Belongings in the work environment was not an indicator for staying or leaving the job.
- Registered nurses are mobile and tend to relocate for a variety of reasons, including family and job advancement.
In-group and out-group sense of belonging and employee satisfaction in the first two years of nursing

There is a difference between in-group and out-group sense of belonging.

- The results indicate that the longer the registered nurse is employed in a job, the more the sense of belonging is correlated to the workplace environment.
Recommendations to Practice

- Employers could implementing programs that improve the sense of belonging by exploring measure that improve job satisfaction and allow the entry level nurse to voice concerns and opinions.
- Employers could establish programs to increase trust, values and communication.
- Nurse educators could model and infuse characteristics into practice that promotes in-group identity and a sense of belonging. This should occur by infusing the concepts of belonging into the curriculum in the transitional courses.
Social Identity Theory Model
References


Banks, Z., & Bailey, J. (2010). Career motivation in newly licensed registered nurses and intention to remain: What makes them enter the field and what makes them remain. (Ph.D.), University of Mississippi Medical Center.


References


References


References


References


